



Available online at globets.org/journal
International Journal of Education, Technology and Science
3(3) (2023) 1078–1111

IJETS
International Journal of
Education Technology and
Science

A CRITICAL ASSESSMENT OF THE EFL CURRICULUM AND THE COURSE BOOK FOR FOURTH GRADE STUDENTS IN LIGHT OF THE CEFR

Şeyda SARI YILDIRIM ^{a 1}

^a Necmettin Erbakan University, School of foreign Languages, Konya, Türkiye

Received: 02.06.2023

Revised version received: 26.08.2023

Accepted: 28.08.2023

Abstract

For a considerable period, Turkey has been engaged in a quest to identify the most optimal English language curriculum, and the CEFR presents a viable avenue for developing such a curriculum. This study aims to investigate the adequacy of the 4th grade English as a Foreign Language (EFL) curriculum and the course book used in the state schools in terms of their effectiveness. The methodology of the study comprised document analysis in order to gather data, followed by a comparative analysis to examine the collected data. The results of the study offer a comprehensive overview of the English language curriculum in primary schools. The study yielded a total of 31 A1 illustrative descriptors sourced from the CEFR and 4th-grade English learning skills. It was found that 15 out of the 31 A1 illustrative descriptors were covered by the learning outcomes. Although the 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum prioritises the development of listening and speaking abilities, it appears to neglect the enhancement of reading, linguistic, and writing proficiencies.

Keywords: Curriculum, 4th grades, A1 Level, CEFR descriptors

© 2021 IJETS & the Authors. Published by *International Journal of Education Technology and Science (IJETS)*. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC BY-NC-ND) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

1. Introduction

Foreign language education has been evolved over the years to meet the enormous global demand. Teacher-centered approaches had shifted the focus of foreign language teaching from

¹Corresponding author: Şeyda SARI YILDIRIM. ORCID ID.: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9290-9809>
E-mail: seydasari@hotmail.co.uk

the teacher to the learner (Sarigöz, 2008). According to contemporary approaches students must accept responsibility for their learning and language education should focus on daily life language teaching, and recently, metacognitive methods have become more significant in the study of foreign languages. Metacognition can be broadly defined as individuals' knowledge of and control over their learning processes (Raofi et al., 2013). The cognitive awareness of one's own intellect is essential in every learning. The idea of "learning to learn" within a lifelong learning perspective could not be separated from the idea of metacognition (Bélanger, 2011). Current foreign language education principles give weight to metacognitive approaches and active use of language.

The Council of Europe (CoE) introduced the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) in 2001 (Council of Europe, 2020). After a comprehensive process of designing, guiding, and discussing, the CEFR has helped to put Europe's language education ideas into practice. Although CEFR is a project for European countries, it has become so common that it has been used around the world (Council of Europe, 2020).

The CEFR serves as a valuable point of reference in educational settings for determining the language proficiency levels of language users, as it offers descriptive illustrations (Mirici, 2014). Descriptively it provides specific scales. Additionally, it presents a range of pedagogical principles that can be employed to optimise the effectiveness of language education contexts. Educationally, it is based on an action-oriented approach and requires adopting three principles namely, learner autonomy, self-assessment and cultural diversity on a global scale (CoE, 2001; Mirici, 2014).

The action-oriented approach used here, commonly speaking, is action-oriented in that it sees students as "social agents," or members of society with responsibilities to complete in a given set of situations, in a specific situation, and within a certain field of activity (Council of Europe, 2001). The action-oriented method gives significance practice of language and action rather than language rules. It gives importance to the daily usage of language (Delibaş & Günday, 2016). Actually, the action-oriented approach could not be dissociated from the CEFR and the action-oriented approach draws its strength from the principles of the CEFR. Acar (2020) stated that the action-oriented method was first announced by the CEFR.

The CEFR has been in use for decades around the world, and it serves as a common foundation for the development of language syllabuses, and curriculum guidelines (Council of Europe, 2001). The CEFR is a road map that must be followed precisely (Council of Europe, 2020). The purpose of language curriculum development procedures is to create language teaching

programs that are relevant, effective, and efficient. The ultimate goals of any technique or program design in language teaching are related to improving language proficiency (Richards, 1984). During the academic year 2001–2002, the MoNE initially conducted the ELP and the CEFR in 20 schools (Hismanoglu, 2013). Since then, the CEFR principles have been closely followed. Turkey invested heavily in education last 20 years. Most of the classrooms were equipped with an interactive whiteboard and the highest quality educational content and equal opportunities were supplied within the scope of the FATİH project (Kızılet & Özmen, 2017). Turkey gives foreign language education great importance and English is among the most prominent foreign language in Turkey. English is regarded as the language of commerce, science, academia, and more. Learning a new language is a difficult process and the process needs intense attention. The Board of Education and Discipline, which serves as the scientific advisor and review, is a part of MoNE and one of the missions of the board is to develop language teaching programs, curriculums, and textbooks (The Board of Education and Discipline Regulation-09/12/2022). In light of recent developments, the EFL curriculum has been revised in accordance with the general objectives of Turkish National Education along with the Main Principles of Turkish National Education. In designing the new English language curriculum, the descriptors and the principles of the CEFR were strictly followed (MONE, 2018) The last English language education curriculum entered into force in 2018 and the revised curriculum has been used since then (The Board of Education and Discipline Regulation, 19/01/2018-15).

The EF English Proficiency Index (EF EPI) ranks annually countries/regions by their English skills and places the surveyed countries/regions into five proficiency bands, from very high to very low. According to EPI scores, Turkey has part in low proficiency level in English learning and among the 34 European countries, Turkey ranks 33rd in Europe (EPI, 2022). The English language learning level hasn't reached the desired level in Turkey (KASAP, 2019). However, Turkey made significant educational investments and frequently updated its curricula. European countries and Turkey use CEFR to design curriculum, however, the success of English language teaching isn't satisfactory in Turkey. The design of a curriculum is difficult, it should be both sufficient and satisfactory. The goal of this research is to evaluate whether the 4th class English language education program and 4th grade English MoNE book cohere with the CEFR descriptors. This study tries to determine whether the 4th class EFL curriculum is comprehensive enough for students and this study investigates whether a more comprehensive 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum is possible.

There is little doubt that English is the most widely used foreign language English is the lingua franca all around the world and it is the language of commerce, science, education, technology, and tourism. English learning increases the chances of getting a job and provides better

educational opportunities. Turkey gives great importance to English learning education and invests heavily in education. Although European countries and Turkey designed the curriculum of EFL in the light of the CEFR descriptors, Turkey hasn't reached the desired level according to EPI scores. The aim of the CEFR is to standardize language learning, assessment and teaching, and it provides a guide for the researcher. However, CEFR doesn't say how to do and CEFR asks what to do. It shows only the route (Council of Europe, 2001). Turkey has been trying to find the best English language education curriculum for years and CEFR provides a way to design a curriculum. CEFR was published for European countries, and it became so common that it has been used all over the world. The Ministry of Education, Turkey (MONE) revised the English language curriculum and MoNE books in accordance with the CEFR in 2018 (MONE, 2018). The CEFR includes can-do descriptors that show what students can accomplish at different levels of language learning. In the light of can-do descriptors textbooks, examinations, assessments, curriculums, etc. can be designed. MONE revised the 4th grade English language curriculum in accordance with the CEFR A1 level can-do descriptors. The last English language education curriculum was revised in 2018 and the revised curriculum has been used since then.

Many studies have been carried out to assess the consistency and relevance of EFL curricula for various grade levels with the criteria of the CEFR (Yüce & Mirici, 2019). Some of them are concerned with the CEFR-based comparison of MoNE books, some of them are about curriculum and the CEFR principles, and some of them are related to the implementation of the CEFR. The majority of studies, meanwhile, were carried out prior to 2018, and there have been few studies regarding the changed curriculum. Hazar (2021) tried to determine the impact of the CEFR on the Turkish national curriculum. The result of English language education is not the desired level. Different policies have been followed to understand what the problem is. In this study, the CEFR communicative language activities were compared with the 6th grade A1 level English language education curriculum, which was developed in accordance with the CEFR principles. This study tries to answer why the adoption of the CEFR fails in terms of communicative language activities. This study advised that Turkish students deserve more attention and during five years only A1 level is a big failure. Mirici & Şengül (2020) investigated assessment in English Language classes with principles of the CEFR and the study's findings indicate a beneficial relationship between academic accomplishment and evaluation processes based on the CEFR principles. This can assist policymakers in developing better curricula and educational practices. Yüce & Mirici (2019) investigated the implementation of the 9th grade English language Education program according to the CEFR proficiency descriptors and educational principles. According to the results of the study, the outcomes of the English language program are not completely compatible with the proficiency descriptors of the CEFR at A1, A1+, and A2 levels. This program includes the educational objectives of the

CEFR, such as self-assessment, action-oriented approach, autonomous learning, task-based learning and developing communicative competence, but it ignores plurilingualism and pluriculturalism. Overall, the study concluded that the EFL program is broadly relevant with regard to the CEFR. This research attempts to determine whether the 4th grade English language education program and the 4th grade English MONE book (Learn with Bouncy) are consistent with the CEFR descriptors. It also seeks to determine whether a more developed 4th-grade English curriculum is possible. In this study, as a research subject 4th grade English education curriculum was selected because the 4th grade English education curriculum covers the 2nd and 3rd grade English education curriculum. In this sense, this research provides a general view of the primary school English education curriculum. The last curriculum about English learning education was published in 2018 and it has started to show its impact on daily life. The effectiveness of the revised curriculum needs to be analysed by the researcher to learn whether it is beneficial. The result of this study may give chance to lead new research in this field. Therefore, the 4th grade English language curriculum and 4th grade English Language MoNE books are worth assessing using the CEFR illustrative descriptors. This study tries to find the following research questions;

- 1) To what extent are the objectives of the 4th grade English language curriculum aligned with the CEFR principles and the illustrative descriptors?
- 2) To what extent is the MoNE 4th grade English Language course book aligned to the CEFR principles and the illustrative descriptors?

2. Method

Document analysis method was adopted in this study. Document analysis is a qualitative scientific research methodology that entails collecting, analysing, and interrogating a variety of documents as the primary resource of study data (SAK et al., 2021). Data were collected through CEFR (CoE, 2001), the MONE English language teaching programme, and the 4th grade English MONE book. Firstly, CEFR A1 Level illustrative Descriptors are obtained from CEFR (Council of Europe, 2001). Secondly, Language Skills and Learning Outcomes were acquired from the English language teaching program (2018) after that 4th-grade MoNE English course book contents were determined (Units; 1: Classroom Rules, 2: Nationality, 3: Cartoon Characters, 4: Free Time, 5: My Day, 6: Fun with Science, 7: Jobs, 8: Clothes, 9: My Friends, 10: Food/Drinks). Then a comparative analysis was carried out to analyse the data obtained. Tesch (1990) states that the comparing and contrasting strategy is utilized for practically all intellectual tasks during analysis, such as generating categories, defining their borders, arranging data, summarizing information, and identifying contradictions. The main aim is to find patterns and conceptual similarities between the Ministry of National Education book contents and the CEFR A1 Level illustrative Descriptors.

3. Results

A1 Level illustrative Descriptors which are obtained from the CEFR (Council of Europe, 2001), are categorized into three parts oral language elements, written communication-reading skills language elements, and linguistic elements. Additionally, the contents of the fourth-grade English MONE books as well as Language Skills and Learning Outcomes were evaluated in each part.

3.1. Oral Language Elements

The CEFR A1 level's illustrative descriptors encompass activities related to reception, interaction, and production. In essence, the four fundamental abilities in language acquisition are listening, writing, reading, and linguistic proficiency. Certain items lack clarity and exhibit a conflation of multiple language proficiencies. As an illustration, the two types of communication that can be engaged in are Conversation, which involves inquiring about the well-being of individuals and reacting to news, and Information Exchange, which entails asking and responding to questions about personal details such as residence, acquaintances, and possessions. Descriptors encompass both oral communication and auditory comprehension abilities. Oral language elements are classified into speaking and listening activities.

The evaluation of the learning skills and outcomes for 4th grade English, as well as the contents of the MONE book for the same grade, were conducted using the oral language descriptors of the CEFR. The Council of Europe's CEFR (2001) provides 13 descriptors for oral language proficiency at the A1 level. The oral language descriptors at the A1 Level pertain to the most basic level of generative language usage. Individuals at the A1 Level possess the ability to engage in uncomplicated interactions and respond to straightforward inquiries, as per the Council of Europe's guidelines in 2001. The 2018 English Language Education Curriculum for fourth-grade students has been specifically crafted to emphasise activities that enhance speaking and listening skills. The curriculum primarily focuses on basic phrases that pertain to everyday routines and specific, tangible scenarios. The findings of the study indicate that the English learning skills and learning outcomes of fourth-grade students encompass a significant portion of the oral language descriptors for level A1. Furthermore, the contents of the English MONE books for fourth-grade students cover a substantial portion of the oral language descriptors for level A1(Refer to Table 1).

Table 1. Evaluation of CEFR Oral Language Descriptors*

	Common Reference Levels: global scale (A1) descriptors	MONE 4 th Grade Curriculum: Learning Skills and Outcomes	MONE 4th Grade Coursebook 'Learn with Bouncy' content

<p>OVERALL ORAL PRODUCTION</p>	<p>Can produce simple mainly isolated phrases about people and places.</p>	<p>Students will be able to;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and announcements (e.g., describing people and their features). - identify different people’s nationalities." -talk about their basic needs and feelings. -identify other people’s jobs and likes in a short, simple oral tex" -talk about other people’s jobs and likes in simple conversations -get the main idea of a simple oral text about the abilities of the self and others." Etc. 	<p>Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin</p> <p>Describing what people do and expressing what people like(Unit-7) What is your job? —I’m a doctor. I work at a hospital.</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn’t.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-7) Where does s/he work? —at the post office. —at the police station</p> <p>Identifying countries and nationalities(Unit-2) Is s/he from Germany? — I think so. Where are you from? — I am from Turkey.</p> <p>Expressing likes and dislikes(Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing.</p> <p>Expressing ability and inability(Unit-3) -I can swim, but I can’t fly. -Can you play the piano? -Can s/he jump?</p> <p>Etc.</p>
---------------------------------------	--	---	--

<p>2-SUSTAINED MONOLOGUE: Putting a case (e.g. in a debate)</p>	<p>Can describe him/herself, what he/she does and where he/she lives.</p>	<p>-Students will be able to; -recognize information about other people. - identify different people’s nationalities. -talk about nations and nationalities. -talk about locations of cities. -understand the general information in an oral text about likes and dislikes -talk about their likes and dislikes. -engage in simple conversations about likes and dislikes" --ask for clarification in conversations. -understand the general and specific information in a short, oral text about daily routines."</p>	<p>Identifying countries and nationalities(Unit-2) Is s/he from Germany? — I think so. Where are you from? — I am from Turkey. Talking about Locations of cities(Unit-2) Where is İzmir? — It’s in the west. Expressing likes and dislikes(Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing. Making simple inquires(Unit-4) Do you like dancing? — Yes, I do. Do you like watching cartoons? — No, I don’t. Asking for clarification(Unit-4) Can you say that again, please? Pardon me? Say that again, please. Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays. Making Simple inquires(Unit-5)</p>

		<p>-talk about their daily routines.</p> <p>-recognize phrases/descriptions about locations.</p> <p>- talk about locations of objects</p> <p>- ask and answer simple clarification questions</p> <p>-identify other people's jobs and likes in a short, simple oral text"</p> <p>-talk about other people's jobs and likes in simple conversations</p> <p>-understand short oral texts about weather conditions and clothing"</p> <p>-recognize the names of the seasons and clothes in short oral texts"</p> <p>- describe the weather conditions."</p> <p>- name the seasons</p> <p>- ask and answer simple questions</p>	<p>What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school.</p> <p>Telling the time and days(Unit-5) What time is it? days of the week at noon/night in the morning/afternoon —It's 7 o'clock</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-6) What is "science" in Turkish?</p> <p>Talking about Locations (Unit-6) Where is the egg? —It's in the cup.</p> <p>Describing what people do and expressing what people like(Unit-7) What is your job? —I'm a doctor. I work at a hospital.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-7) Where does s/he work? —at the post office. —at the police station</p> <p>Describing the weather(Unit-8) What's the weather like? —It's sunny today. What's the weather like in Ankara in winter?</p> <p>Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin.</p>
--	--	---	--

		<p>about weather conditions and clothing items in simple conversations.</p> <p>- understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and announcements (e.g., describing people and their features).</p> <p>-understand short, oral texts about possessions.</p> <p>-describe their friends and other people (family members, teachers, etc.).</p> <p>-ask and answer questions about other people's physical characteristics"</p> <p>-talk about possessions."</p> <p>-talk about their basic needs and feelings.</p> <p>-express others' feelings and their needs."</p>	
--	--	--	--

<p>3-ADDRESSING AUDIENCES</p>	<p>Can read a very short, rehearsed statement – e.g. to introduce a speaker, propose a toast</p>	<p>*No learning skills and outcomes available</p>	<p>*No content available</p>
<p>4-OVERALL LISTENING COMPREHENSION</p>	<p>Can follow speech which is very slow and carefully articulated, with long pauses for him/her to assimilate meaning</p>	<p>Students will be able to;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -understand the general and specific information in a short, oral text about daily routines." -understand and follow simple instructions -understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and announcements (e.g., describing people and their features). -understand short, oral texts about possessions. -understand the offers about their basic needs. Etc. 	<p>Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays.</p> <p>Giving responding simple instructions(Unit-6)</p> <p>Describing what people do and expressing what people like(Unit-7) What is your job? —I’m a doctor. I work at a hospital.</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-3) This is her/his/my/your guitar. Is this your character? Talking about possessions(Unit-9) I have brown hair. S/he has brown eyes. My/your hair is short</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn’t. Etc.</p>
<p>5-LISTENING TO ANNOUNCEMENTS AND INSTRUCTIONS</p>	<p>Can understand instructions addressed carefully and slowly to him/her and follow</p>	<p>Students will be able to;</p>	<p>Giving responding simple instructions(Unit-6)</p> <p>Plant it. Water it. Cut the paper.</p>

	short, simple directions.	-recognize simple classroom instructions - give and respond to simple instructions verbally. -understand and follow simple instructions	Don't cut it now!
6-OVERALL SPOKEN INTERACTION	Can interact in a simple way but communication is totally dependent on repetition at a slower rate of speech, rephrasing and repair. Can ask and answer simple questions, initiate and respond to simple statements in areas of immediate need or on very familiar topics.	Students will be able to; -talk about their own and others' possessions. -deliver a simple, brief speech about abilities with an initial --talk about their daily routines. Etc.	Expressing ability and inability(Unit-3) -I can swim, but I can't fly. -Can you play the piano? -Can s/he jump? Talking about possessions(Unit-3) This is her/his/my/your guitar. Is this your character? Etc.
7- UNDERSTANDING A NATIVE SPEAKER INTERLOCUTOR	Can understand everyday expressions aimed at the satisfaction of simple needs of a concrete type, delivered directly to him/her in clear, slow and repeated speech by a sympathetic speaker. Can understand questions and instructions addressed carefully and slowly to him/her and follow	Students will be able to; -understand the general and specific information in a short, oral text about daily routines." - talk about their daily routines - recognize simple classroom instructions	Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays. Making Simple inquires(Unit-5) What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school Telling the time and days(Unit-5) What time is it? days of the week at noon/night in the morning/afternoon —It's 7 o'clock

	<p>short, simple directions.</p>	<p>-give and respond to simple instructions verbally</p> <p>- give short and basic instructions</p> <p>-understand short oral texts about weather conditions and clothing.</p> <p>-recognize the names of the seasons and clothes in short oral texts</p> <p>-describe the weather conditions."</p> <p>-Students will be able to name the seasons</p> <p>-ask and answer simple questions about weather conditions and clothing items in simple conversations.</p> <p>- recognize simple words and phrases about food and drinks.</p> <p>-understand the offers about their basic needs.</p> <p>-identify others' needs and feelings in simple oral texts"</p>	<p>Giving responding simple instructions(Unit-6) Plant it. Water it. Cut the paper. Don't cut it now!</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-6) What is "science" in Turkish?</p> <p>Describing what people do and expressing what people like(Unit-7) What is your job? —I'm a doctor. I work at a hospital.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-7) Where does s/he work? —at the post office. —at the police station</p> <p>Describing the weather(Unit-8) What's the weather like? —It's sunny today. What's the weather like in Ankara in winter?</p> <p>Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin.</p> <p>Making offers(Unit-10) Do you want a sandwich? Want a sandwich? —No, thanks. I'm full. —Yes, please.</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't.</p>
--	----------------------------------	--	--

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - talk about their basic needs and feelings. - express others' feelings and their needs." 	
--	--	--	--

8-CONVERSATION	<p>Can make an introduction and use basic greeting and leave-taking expressions.</p> <p>Can ask how people are and react to the news.</p> <p>Can understand everyday expressions aimed at the satisfaction of simple needs of a concrete type, delivered directly to him/her in a clear, slow and repeated speech by a sympathetic speaker.</p>	<p>Students will be able to;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ask for clarification in conversations. -understand the general information in an oral text about likes and dislikes -talk about their likes and dislikes. -understand the general and specific information in a short, oral text about daily routines." -talk about their daily routines -engage in simple conversations about likes and dislikes" - ask and answer simple clarification questions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Expressing likes and dislikes(Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing. -Making simple inquires(Unit-4) Do you like dancing? — Yes, I do. Do you like watching cartoons? — No, I don't. -Asking for clarification(Unit-4) Can you say that again, please? Pardon me? / Say that again, please. -Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays. -Making Simple inquires (Unit-5-6-7) What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school. What is "science" in Turkish?
-----------------------	---	---	--

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - identify other people's jobs and likes in a short, simple oral text" -talk about other people's jobs and likes in simple conversations - understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and announcements (e.g., describing people and their features). - understand short, oral texts about possessions. - describe their friends and other people (family members, teachers, etc.). -ask and answer questions about other people's physical characteristics -talk about possessions." -recognize simple words and phrases about food and drinks. 	<p>Telling the time and days(Unit-5) What time is it? days of the week / at noon/night in the morning/afternoon —It's 7 o'clock -Describing what people do and expressing what people like(Unit-7) -Making Simple request(Unit-8) Can I take your umbrella? —Here you are. —No. Sorry, it's broken. -Describing the weather(Unit-8) What's the weather like? —It's sunny today. What's the weather like in Ankara in winter? -Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin. -Talking about possessions(Unit-3) This is her/his/my/your guitar. Is this your character? Talking about possessions(Unit-9) I have brown hair. S/he has brown eyes. My/your hair is short</p> <p>Making offers(Unit-10) Do you want a sandwich? Want a sandwich? —No, thanks. I'm full.</p>
--	--	---	--

		<p>-understand the offers about their basic needs.</p> <p>-identify others' needs and feelings in simple oral texts"</p> <p>- talk about their basic needs and feelings.</p> <p>-express others' feelings and their needs."</p>	<p>—Yes, please.</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10)</p> <p>I want some milk, please.</p> <p>Is s/he thirsty?</p> <p>—Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't.</p>
<p>9-GOAL-ORIENTED CO-OPERATION (e.g. Repairing a car, discussing a document, organising an event)</p>	<p>-Can understand questions and instructions addressed carefully and slowly to him/her and follow short, simple directions.</p> <p>-Can ask people for things, and give people things.</p>	<p>Students will be able to;</p> <p>-recognize simple classroom instructions</p> <p>-give and respond to simple instructions verbally</p> <p>-give short and basic instructions</p> <p>-understand the offers about their basic needs.</p>	<p>Giving responding simple instructions(Unit-6)</p> <p>Plant it. Water it.</p> <p>Cut the paper.</p> <p>Don't cut it now!</p>

<p>10- TRANSACTIONS TO OBTAIN GOODS AND SERVICES</p>	<p>Can ask people for things and give people things. Can handle numbers, quantities, cost and time.</p>	<p>-Students will be able to; -recognize simple words and phrases about food and drinks. -understand the offers about their basic needs. -recognize numbers from one to fifty -count up to fifty" -recognize the time in a short oral text." - talk about the time.</p>	<p>Naming numbers 1-50 Making Simple inquires(Unit-5) What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school. Telling the time and days(Unit-5) What time is it? days of the week/ at noon/night in the morning/afternoon —It’s 7 o’clock Making Simple inquires(Unit-6) What is “science” in Turkish? Making Simple inquires(Unit-7)</p>
<p>11-INFORMATION EXCHANGE</p>	<p>Can understand questions and instructions addressed carefully and slowly to him/her and follow short, simple directions. Can ask and answer simple questions, initiate and respond to simple statements in areas of immediate need</p>	<p>-Students will be able to; -recognize simple classroom instructions -give and respond to simple instructions verbally - give short and basic instructions - recognize possessions of others in a clear, short and slow oral text.</p>	<p>Identifying countries and nationalities(Unit-2) Is s/he from Germany? — I think so. Where are you from? — I am from Turkey. Talking about Locations of cities(Unit-2) Where is İzmir? — It’s in the west. Expressing ability and inability(Unit-3) -I can swim, but I can’t fly. -Can you play the piano? -Can s/he jump? Talking about possessions(Unit-3)</p>

	<p>or on very familiar topics.</p> <p>Can ask and answer questions about themselves and other people, where they live, people they know, things they have.</p> <p>Can indicate time by such phrases as next week, last Friday, in November, three o'clock</p>	<p>- get the main idea of a simple oral text about the abilities of the self and others."</p> <p>- identify different people's nationalities."</p> <p>-talk about nations and nationalities.</p> <p>-talk about locations of cities."</p> <p>-recognize the time in a short oral text."</p> <p>-talk about the time.</p> <p>-recognize phrases/descriptions about locations."</p> <p>-talk about locations of objects</p> <p>-understand short oral texts about weather conditions and clothing"</p> <p>-recognize the names of the seasons and clothes in short oral texts"</p> <p>- describe the weather conditions."</p> <p>-name the seasons</p>	<p>This is her/his/my/your guitar.</p> <p>Is this your character?</p> <p>Talking about daily routines(Unit-5)</p> <p>I wake up in the morning.</p> <p>I do my homework.</p> <p>I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-5)</p> <p>What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school.</p> <p>Telling the time and days(Unit-5)</p> <p>What time is it? days of the week at noon/night in the morning/afternoon —It's 7 o'clock</p> <p>Giving responding simple instructions(Unit-6)</p> <p>Plant it. Water it.</p> <p>Cut the paper.</p> <p>Don't cut it now!</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-6)</p> <p>What is "science" in Turkish?</p> <p>Talking about Locations (Unit-6)</p> <p>Where is the egg? —It's in the cup.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-7)</p>
--	---	--	---

		<p>-ask and answer simple questions about weather conditions and clothing items in simple conversations.</p> <p>-understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and announcements (e.g., describing people and their features).</p> <p>-understand short, oral texts about possessions.</p> <p>-describe their friends and other people (family members, teachers, etc.).</p> <p>-ask and answer questions about other people's physical characteristics"</p> <p>-talk about possessions."</p> <p>-talk about their own and others' possessions.</p> <p>-deliver a simple, brief speech about abilities with an initial</p>	<p>Making Simple request(Unit-8) Can I take your umbrella? —Here you are. —No. Sorry, it's broken.</p> <p>Describing the weather(Unit-8) What's the weather like? —It's sunny today. What's the weather like in Ankara in winter?</p> <p>Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin.</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-9) I have brown hair. S/he has brown eyes. My/your hair is short</p> <p>Making offers(Unit-10) Do you want a sandwich? Want a sandwich? —No, thanks. I'm full. —Yes, please.</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't</p>
--	--	---	---

		<p>- talk about their daily routines</p>	
<p>12-SPOKEN FLUENCY</p>	<p>Can manage very short, isolated, mainly pre-packaged utterances, with much pausing to search for expressions, to articulate less familiar words, and to repair communication.</p>	<p>-Students will be able to;</p> <p>-interact with their classmates through asking for and giving permission in short utterances.</p> <p>-talk about their likes and dislikes.</p> <p>- talk about their daily routines.</p> <p>-talk about possessions."</p> <p>-talk about their basic needs and feelings.</p> <p>-give and respond to simple instructions verbally.</p> <p>-ask and answer simple questions about weather conditions and clothing items in</p>	<p>Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays</p> <p>Expressing likes and dislikes(Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing.</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-3) -This is her/his/my/your guitar. -Is this your character?</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-9) I have brown hair. S/he has brown eyes. My/your hair is short</p>

		<p>simple conversations</p> <p>-ask and answer questions about other people's physical characteristics"</p> <p>Etc.</p>	<p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't.</p> <p>Describing people(Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin</p> <p>Making Simple inquires(Unit-5) What do you do at noon/in the afternoon? —I have lunch at school. Etc.</p>
<p>13- INTERVIEWING AND BEING INTERVIEWED</p>	<p>Can reply in an interview to simple direct questions spoken very slowly and clearly in direct nonidiomatic speech about personal details.</p>	<p>-Students will be able to;</p> <p>-interact with their classmates through asking for and giving permission in short utterances.</p> <p>-talk about their likes and dislikes.</p> <p>-talk about their daily routines.</p> <p>-talk about possessions."</p> <p>-talk about their basic needs and feelings. Etc.</p>	<p>Talking about daily routines(Unit-5) I wake up in the morning. I do my homework. I go shopping with my mom on Saturdays</p> <p>Expressing likes and dislikes(Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing.</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-3) -This is her/his/my/your guitar. -Is this your character?</p> <p>Talking about possessions(Unit-9)</p>

			<p>I have brown hair. S/he has brown eyes. My/your hair is short</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling(Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't.</p> <p>Etc.</p>
--	--	--	---

*Items are adapted from Council of Europe (2001), MONE Curriculum (2018) and MONE 4th Grade Coursebook (Learn with Bouncy)

As per the findings presented in Table 1, the learning skills and outcomes pertaining to 4th Grade English, as well as the contents of the 4th Grade English MONE books, prioritise the development of speaking and listening proficiency. It is noteworthy that these materials encompass 12 out of 13 illustrative descriptors related to oral language. Oral language components, specifically speaking and listening activities, are classified as integral aspects of the curriculum, exhibiting notable proficiency in this area. Table 1 illustrates that the curriculum encompasses more than solely the "addressing audiences" descriptor. The concept of "addressing audiences" pertains to delivering a fundamental exposition on a well-known topic. The English Language MONE book and curriculum do not incorporate this particular descriptor. Nevertheless, the Council of Europe has released a document in 2018 that compiles representative examples of language competency descriptors for young learners. This document presents pertinent descriptors for students aged 7-10, and the "addressing audiences" descriptor is deemed suitable for adaptation to this age group (Council of Europe, 2018).

3.2. *Written Communication-Reading Skills Language Elements*

The present study involved an evaluation of the 4th Grade English Learning skills and Learning outcomes, as well as the contents of the 4th grade English MONE book, through the application of CEFR writing and reading skills language descriptors. The A1 descriptors for writing and reading skills have been derived from the CEFR (Council of Europe, 2001). The descriptors for writing and reading skills at the A1 level encompass fundamental objectives for both areas. Although the Learning Skills and Learning Outcomes in 4th-grade English MONE books do not explicitly address Reading and Writing skills, certain exercises, such as "look and write," are included. These exercises are not directly related to writing and reading activities, but rather form part of the speaking and listening activities (Refer to Table 2).

Table 2. Evaluation of CEFR Writing and Reading Skills Language Descriptors*

	Common Reference Levels: global scale (A1) descriptors	MONE 4 th Grade Curriculum: Learning Skills and outcomes	MONE 4 th Grade Coursebook (Learn with Bouncy) content
1-OVERALL WRITTEN PRODUCTION	Can write simple isolated phrases and sentences	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
2-CREATIVE WRITING	Can write simple phrases and sentences about themselves and imaginary people, where they live and what they do.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
3-OVERALL READING COMPREHENSION	Can understand very short, simple texts a single phrase at a time, picking up familiar names, words and basic phrases and rereading as required.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
4-READING CORRESPONDENCE	Can understand short, simple messages on postcards.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
5-READING FOR ORIENTATION	Can recognise familiar names, words and very basic phrases on simple notices in the most common everyday situations.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
6-READING FOR INFORMATION AND ARGUMENT	Can get an idea of the content of simpler informational material and short simple descriptions, especially if there is visual support.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available

7-READING INSTRUCTIONS	Can follow short, simple written directions (e.g. to go from X to Y).	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
8-OVERALL WRITTEN INTERACTION	Can ask for or pass on personal details in written form.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
9CORRESPONDENCE	Can write a short simple postcard	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
10-NOTES, MESSAGES & FORMS	Can write numbers and dates, own name, nationality, address, age, date of birth or arrival in the country, etc. such as on a hotel registration form	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
11-PROCESSING TEXT	Can copy out single words and short texts presented in standard printed format.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available

*Table 2 items are adapted from Council of Europe (2001), MONE Curriculum (2018) and MONE 4th Grade Coursebook (Learn with Bouncy)

Based on the findings presented in Table 2, it can be observed that the fourth-grade English learning skills and learning outcomes do not encompass any of the 11 language elements' illustrative descriptors pertaining to written communication and reading skills in the English language. The book in question offers a restricted number of exercises that focus on reading and writing skills, which are incorporated as a component of the speaking and listening activities.

The activities of writing and reading are classified under the domain of "Written Communication-Reading Skills Language Elements". However, it has been observed that the

curriculum and MONE book do not encompass any of the 11 illustrative descriptors pertaining to the aforementioned skills. The Global Scale of English (GSE) learning objectives for young learners were formulated by Pearson. This scale serves as a means to delineate the competencies that a student is capable of exhibiting at varying levels. According to Pearson (2019), students between the ages of 7 and 14 have the ability to produce uncomplicated and elementary sentences, connect two sentences using the conjunction "and," compose sentences with a single clause, and replicate a given model in their written work. According to Pearson (2019), individuals between the ages of 7 and 14 possess the cognitive ability to comprehend uncomplicated sentences, follow fundamental written directives, grasp basic phrases within concise and straightforward texts, and comprehend brief and straightforward messages. The Pearson Scale indicates that the reading and writing skills descriptors at Level A1 are suitable for students between the ages of 7 and 14. Furthermore, as previously stated, the Council of Europe released a publication in 2018 that presents compiled and representative examples of language competency descriptors that were developed for young learners. This document features pertinent descriptors for individuals between the ages of 7 and 10. The A1 level writing and reading descriptors pertain to fundamental writing and reading competencies, and all language components associated with A1 level written communication-reading skills are suitable for modification to suit individuals aged 7-10, as per the Council of Europe (2018).

3.3. *Linguistic Skills Elements*

Within the context of fourth-grade English, the following information pertains. The linguistic skills descriptors of the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR), including grammatical, phonological, sociolinguistic, orthographic, coherence, and cohesion, were utilised to assess the contents of the 4th grade English MONE book, specifically focusing on learning skills and learning outcomes. The CEFR (Council of Europe, 2001) provides seven A1 descriptors for linguistic skills. The A1 Level linguistic skills descriptors encompass fundamental language abilities, uncomplicated grammatical structures, and the enunciation of a severely restricted range of memorised vocabulary, among other characteristics.

Table 3. Evaluation of CEFR Linguistic Skills Descriptors*

	Common Reference Levels: global scale (A1) descriptors	MONE 4 th Grade Curriculum: Learning Skills and outcomes	MONE 4 th Grade Coursebook (Learn with Bouncy) content
1-GENERAL LINGUISTIC RANGE	Has a very basic range of simple expressions about personal details and needs of a concrete type	Students will be able to; -understand the main point in short, clear, simple messages and	Describing people (Unit-9) What does s/he look like? She is tall and slim. He is young and thin

		<p>announcements (e.g., describing people and their features).</p> <p>--identify different people's nationalities."</p> <p>-Students will be able to talk about their basic needs and feelings.</p> <p>-Students will be able to identify other people's jobs and likes in a short, simple oral text"</p> <p>-Students will be able to talk about other people's jobs and likes in simple conversations Etc.</p>	<p>Describing what people do and expressing what people like (Unit-7) What is your job? —I'm a doctor. I work at a hospital.</p> <p>Expressing basic needs and feeling (Unit-10) I want some milk, please. Is s/he thirsty? —Yes, s/he is. / No, s/he isn't.</p> <p>Making Simple inquires (Unit-7) Where does s/he work? —at the post office. —at the police station</p> <p>Identifying countries and nationalities (Unit-2) Is s/he from Germany? — I think so. Where are you from? — I am from Turkey.</p> <p>Expressing likes and dislikes (Unit-4) I like playing chess/reading. I dislike singing.</p> <p>Etc.</p>
--	--	--	--

2-VOCABULARY RANGE	Has a basic vocabulary repertoire of isolated words and phrases related to particular concrete situations.	The curriculum contains basic vocabulary repertoire related to learning outcomes	The coursebook contains basic vocabulary repertoire related to learning outcomes
3-GRAMMATICAL ACCURACY	Shows only limited control of a few simple grammatical structures and sentence patterns in a learnt repertoire.	<p>Students will be able to get the main idea of a simple oral text about the abilities of the self and others</p> <p>Students will be able to talk about their likes and dislikes</p>	<p>Expressing ability and inability (Unit-3) -I can swim, but I can't fly. -Can you play the piano? -Can s/he jump?</p> <p>Making simple inquires (Unit-4) Do you like dancing? — Yes, I do. Do you like watching cartoons? — No, I don't.</p>
4-PHONOLOGICAL CONTROL	Pronunciation of a very limited repertoire of learnt words and phrases can be understood with some effort by native speakers used to dealing with speakers of his/her language group.	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available
5-ORTHOGRAPHIC CONTROL	<p>Can copy familiar words and short phrases e.g. simple signs or instructions, names of everyday objects, names of shops and set phrases used regularly.</p> <p>Can spell his/her address, nationality and other personal details</p>	*No learning skills and outcomes available	*No content available

<p>6-SOCIOLINGUISTIC APPROPRIATENESS</p>	<p>Can establish basic social contact by using the simplest everyday polite forms of: greetings and farewells; introductions; saying please, thank you, sorry, etc</p>	<p>-Students will be able to understand short and clear utterances about: requests and permission</p> <p>-Students will be able to interact with their classmates through asking for and giving permission in short utterances.</p> <p>-Students will be able to make requests by using simple utterances. "Students will be able to make simple request about borrowing</p>	<p>Asking for permission (Unit-1) Can/May I come in/go out? — Yes, you can. — Sure/Of course. — Sorry, not right now.</p> <p>Making simple request (Unit-1) Give me the book, please. — Sure/Of course. — Here you are.</p> <p>Telling someone what to do (Unit-1) Be quiet, please. Open/close the door, please.</p> <p>Making Simple request (Unit-8) Can I take your umbrella? —Here you are. —No. Sorry, it's broken.</p> <p>Making offers (Unit-10) Do you want a sandwich? Want a sandwich?</p>
<p>7-COHERENCE AND COHESION</p>	<p>Can link words or groups of words with very basic linear connectors like 'and' or 'then'.</p>	<p>*No learning skills and outcomes available</p>	<p>*No content available</p>

*Table 3 items are adapted from Council of Europe (2001), MONE Curriculum (2018), and MONE 4th Grade Coursebook (Learn with Bouncy)

Based on the findings presented in Table 3, it can be observed that the fourth-grade English Learning Skills and Learning Outcomes, as well as the fourth-grade English MONE books, encompass three out of the seven oral illustrative descriptors. The categorization of linguistic skills descriptors into various elements, including grammatical, phonological, sociolinguistic, orthographic, coherence, and cohesion, is a common practice. In the context of the curriculum and MONE book, three out of the seven linguistic skills descriptors are covered, while the remaining elements, namely grammatical, phonological, orthographic, coherence, and cohesion, are not addressed. While the curriculum and MONE book do include certain grammatical competencies, their scope is quite restricted. The A1 level descriptors are designed to impart fundamental competencies in phonology, orthography, coherence, and cohesion. However, it appears that these skills are overlooked in both the curriculum and the MONE book.

According to Pearson (2021), children between the ages of 7 and 14 possess the ability to comprehend the letters of the alphabet, distinguish between different word stresses, spell familiar words, utilise proper punctuation in the form of capital letters and full stops, employ question marks, utilise apostrophes for contractions, and utilise the conjunction "and" to link words. The Pearson Scale A1 Level Linguistic skills descriptors have been deemed suitable for pupils between the ages of 7 and 14 years old. Furthermore, as previously stated, the Council of Europe released a publication in 2018 containing compiled and representative examples of language competency descriptors tailored for young learners. This document presents pertinent descriptors applicable to individuals aged 7-10. The Council of Europe (2018) has stated that the A1-level linguistic element descriptors pertain to fundamental linguistic competencies, and that all A1-level linguistic skill elements are amenable to modification for utilisation among individuals aged 7-10.

3.4. Evaluation of Curriculum

This section of the research involved an assessment of the 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum in comparison to the 4th grade English Education Curriculum (Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches-Germany-2018). The acquisition of skills related to speaking/listening, reading, writing, and linguistic proficiency (including grammar and pronunciation) can be attributed to both curricula. As previously stated, the fourth-grade English learning outcomes prioritise the development of listening and speaking skills, while reading, writing, and linguistic abilities are not given as much emphasis. The English curriculum of Niedersächsisches in Germany encompasses a comprehensive range of language competencies, including but not limited to listening and speaking abilities, as well as reading, writing, and linguistic aptitudes. (Niedersächsischen Kultusministerium, 2018).

Table 4. Evaluation of Curriculum (MONE-Türkiye & Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches-Germany)*

	4 th Grade Germany English Language Education Curriculum Content	MONE 4 th Grade Curriculum: Learning skills and outcomes
SPEAKING/ LISTENING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -understand simple instructions in everyday teaching -understand simple questions and statements that relate to oneself and the immediate environment -understand the rough plot of simple dialogues and stories -talk about themselves -<i>name and describe familiar objects and activities use classroom phrases</i> -introduce themselves or other people in a dialogue. -ask and answer short questions using simple, well-known phrases etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> understand the general and specific information in a short, oral text about daily routines." ask and answer simple clarification questions understand short and clear utterances about: requests-permission get the main idea of a simple oral text about the abilities of the self and others." talk about their basic needs and feelings. ask and answer simple clarification questions etc.
READING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -read and understand short instructions, questions and statements (from everyday teaching) -extract essential information from short, simple texts if key words and structures are known read and understand (personal) communications etc. 	No content available
WRITING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -write single well-known words and short sentences with the help of templates -Write individual short well-known texts with the help of templates -transfer words and simple phrases from the blackboard or from text templates etc 	No content available
LINGUISTIC SKILLS	<p>Grammar:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -understand simple statements, questions and requests in affirmative and negative form and apply them with the help of structures. 	No content available

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -understand and use simple spatial relationships(use selected prepositions) (name numbers, adjectives as well as regular singular/plural, selected pronouns) pronunciation and intonation -recognize and imitate typical pronunciation and intonation patterns -pronounce commonly used words and phrases recognize regularities in familiar sound and intonation patterns Intercultural communication skills -recognize similarities and differences between different cultural backgrounds and traditions -gain intercultural experience and to get involved in foreign situations -experience the cultural connection between intonation, gestures and facial expressions 	
--	---	--

*Table 4 items are adapted from Niedersächsisches-Germany Curriculum (Feder et al., 2018) and MONE Curriculum (2018)

As per the findings presented in Table 4, the evaluated curriculum places a greater emphasis on improving student's speaking and listening abilities in 4th grade English learning outcomes. Conversely, comparatively less emphasis is placed on developing reading, linguistic, and writing skills. By way of comparison, the Curriculum (Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches) for English language education in Niedersächsisches-Germany encompasses a broader spectrum of linguistic abilities, encompassing listening, speaking, reading, writing, and linguistic competencies. According to the research results, the primary emphasis of the 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum is on the enhancement of listening and speaking proficiencies. In contrast, the 4th grade English Education Curriculum (Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches-Germany) is more extensive, covering a wider range of competencies and academic topics

4. Conclusions

The findings indicate that a total of 31 A1 illustrative descriptors were derived from the CEFR and the fourth level. The assessment of English language learning abilities and educational achievements encompasses 15 of the 31 A1 illustrative descriptors. The curriculum exhibits a notable strength in the domain of oral language components. The curriculum comprehensively addresses a significant portion of the oral language elements descriptors at the A1 level. This

result is similar to what Yüce and Mirici reported (2019) that the 9th-grade EFL curriculum corresponds to 29 of the 25 outcomes (86.2%) for speaking competence.

Conversely, the curriculum fails to address the language components of written communication and reading skills, and it does not encompass any of the explanatory descriptors. The English MONE books designed for fourth-grade students offer a restricted range of exercises that focus on reading and writing skills. Similarly, Hazar (2021) mentioned that the CEFR provides a correspondence scale (notes, messages, interaction through notes, and information transfer) for an interpersonal framework. However, the curriculum contains no descriptions of these. The findings indicate that the curriculum neglects the components related to linguistic abilities. The A1 Level linguistic skills descriptors encompass fundamental language abilities, uncomplicated grammatical constructions, and the enunciation of a restricted set of memorised vocabulary, among other features. Nonetheless, the educational programme incorporates three out of seven verbal explanatory characteristics.

The evaluation of the 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum was conducted in comparison with the 4th grade English Education Curriculum (Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches) in Germany. The fourth-grade English learning outcomes prioritise the development of speaking and listening abilities while reading, linguistic, and writing skills are not given as much emphasis. In contrast, the English Education Curriculum (Kerncurriculum of Niedersächsisches) in Germany encompasses a broader range of language skills, including listening, speaking, reading, writing, and linguistic competencies. As per the findings of the research, it has been observed that the 4th grade English Language Education Curriculum primarily focuses on the development of listening and speaking abilities. The scope of the subject matter is broader. Fisne, Gungor, Guerra & and Goncalves compared the Turkish and Portuguese English Language Education coursebook and curriculum (3rd and 4th grade primary school). This investigation found similar conclusions to this research. Fisne et al. (2018) state that each curriculum focuses on different language abilities. While the Turkish curriculum concentrates on listening, and speaking, with very limited writing and reading abilities, The Portuguese curriculum places more emphasis on reading, speaking, writing, and listening abilities as well as grammar, lexis, and intercultural domains in the third and fourth-grade classrooms.

As a result, a notable disparity exists between the English education syllabus for fourth-grade students in Türkiye and the CEFR standards. English language education plays a pivotal role in facilitating commerce, scientific pursuits, academic endeavours, and other domains. Over the past two decades, Türkiye has made substantial investments in the field of education. Upon examination of the English language curriculum in Türkiye, it is evident that there remains ample room for improvement in order to achieve a truly effective and productive implementation, despite certain targeted endeavours to construct a suitable curriculum in accordance with established European standards. It is recommended that the authorities allocate greater attention to addressing inadequate curricula in order to fully leverage the advantages offered by the CEFR. It is recommended that the curriculum be revised to align with the CEFR in order to provide a more comprehensive educational programme.

Declaration of Conflicting Interests and Ethics

Authors must identify and declare any personal circumstances or interests that may be perceived as inappropriately influencing the representation or interpretation of reported research results. If there is no conflict of interest, please state "The authors declare no conflict of interest."

References

- Acar, A. (2020). The implementation of the Action-oriented Approach in Language Textbooks. *Trakya Journal of Education*, 10(3), 864-880. <https://doi.org/10.24315/tred.656990>
- Akseki, Ö., Çalışkan Kılıç, G., Çelik, E., Dikilikaya, E., Kara, Z., Pangal, O., Sarı, M., & Yücel, N. (2019). Learn with Bouncy- 4th Grade Student's Book (Z. Kara, Ed.). MONE.
- Bélanger, P. (2011). Theories in Adult Learning and Education (R. Egetenmeyer, Ed.). Barbara Budrich Publishers. <https://doi.org/10.3224/86649362>
- Council of Europe (CoE). (2001). Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Council of Europe (CoE). (2018). Collated Representative Samples of Descriptors of Language Competences Developed for Young Learners. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Council of Europe (CoE). (2020). Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment: companion volume. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Delibaş, M., & Günday, R. (2016). Action-Oriented Approach In Foreign Language Teaching. Participatory Educational Research (PER) - Peer Review Academic Journal, Special Issue 2016-IV;144-153, November, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.partedres.com>
- EF EPI. (2022). EF English Proficiency Index - A Ranking of 111 Countries and Regions by English Skills. Education First. Retrieved from www.ef.com/epiwww.efset.org
- Feder, A., Franke, S., Hintz, A., Hoppe, M., Pertiet, A., Steinbeck, R. (2018). Kerncurriculum für die Grundschule Schuljahrgänge 3 - 4 (Englisch). Herausgegeben vom Niedersächsischen Kultusministerium. Retrieved from <http://www.cuvo.nibis.de>
- Fişne, F. N., Güngör, M. N., Guerra, L., & Gonçalves, O. (2018). A CEFR-based Comparison of ELT Curriculum and Course Books Used in Turkish and Portuguese Primary Schools. *Novitas-ROYAL (Research on Youth and Language)*, 2018,12(2), 129–151. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1195279.pdf>
- Hazar, E. (2021). The influence of the CEFR in Turkish National Curriculum. *African Educational Research Journal*, 9(2), 551–561. <https://doi.org/10.30918/AERJ.92.21.087>
- Hismanoglu, M. (2013). Does English Language Teacher Education Curriculum Promote CEFR Awareness of Prospective EFL Teachers? *Procedia - Social and Behavioural Sciences*, 93, 938–945. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.09.307>
- Kasap, S. (2019). English Education in Turkey from the Perspective of Academics. *Yuzuncu Yil Universitesi Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi (YYU Journal of Faculty of Education)*, 2019; 16(1):1032-1053, <http://efdergi.yyu.edu.tr> - <https://doi.org/10.23891/efdyyu.2019.152>
- Kizilet, E., & Özmen, K. S. (2017). Evaluation of A Nationwide Ict Reform Movement in Turkey: Insights From the Fatih Project. *I-Manager's Journal on School Educational Technology*, 13(1). Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1269383.pdf>

- Mirici, I. H. (2014). The Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and the European Language Portfolio (ELP) in S. Çelik (Ed.) Approaches and Principles in English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Education. Ankara: Eğitim.
- Mirici, I. H., & Şengül, F. (2020). Assessment in EFL classes based on CEFR principles. *Bartın University Journal of Faculty of Education*, 9(2), 252–263. <https://doi.org/10.14686/buefad.655985>
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE) (2018). English language teaching curriculum for 2-8th Grades (İngilizce Dersi Öğretim Programı (İlkokul ve Ortaokul 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 ve 8. Sınıflar). Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı. Retrieved from <http://mufredat.meb.gov.tr/Dosyalar/201812411191321-%C4%B0NG%C4%B0L%C4%B0ZCE%20%C3%96%C4%9ERET%C4%B0M%20PROGRAMI%20Klas%C3%B6r%C3%BC.pdf>
- Pearson. (2019). Global Scale of English Learning Objectives for Young Learners. Retrieved from <https://www.pearson.com/languages/why-pearson/the-global-scale-of-english/resources.html>
- Pearson. (2021). Global Scale of English Assessment Framework for Young Learners. Retrieved from https://www.pearson.com/content/dam/one-dot-com/one-dot-com/english/SupportingDocs/GSE_Assessment_Young.pdf
- Raofi, S., Chan, S. H., Mukundan, J., & Md Rashid, S. (2013). Metacognition and second/foreign language learning. *English Language Teaching*, 7(1), 36–49. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v7n1p36>
- Richards, J. C. (1984). Language Curriculum Development. *RELC Journal*, 15(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003368828401500101>
- Sarıgöz, İ.H., (2008). Towards Individual Centered Foreign Language Teaching. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, Vol.4, No.1, April 2008. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/104691>
- Sak, R., Şahin Sak, İ. T., Sendil, C. Ö., & Nas, E. (2021). Document Analysis As A Research Method. *Kocaeli University Journal of Education*, 4(1), 227-250. <https://doi.org/10.33400/kuje.843306>
- Tesch, R. (1990). *Qualitative Research: Analysis Types and Software Tools*. Published by Routledge Falmer, London and New York.
- The Board of Education and Discipline Regulation (09/12/2022-6512) (Talim ve Tebiye Kurulu Yönetmeliği-(09/12/2022-6512)), Resmi Gazete-32039. Retrieved from https://ttkb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2022_12/10135702_ttkbyonetmeli20221210.pdf
- The Board of Education and Discipline Regulation Order- 19/01/2018-15 (Talim ve Tebiye Kurulu Başkanlığının-19/01/2018-15 Tarihli Düzenlemesi.) Retrieved from <http://mufredat.meb.gov.tr/ProgramDetay.aspx?PID=327>
- Yüce, E., & Mirici, I. H. (2019). A Qualitative Inquiry into the Application of 9th grade EFL Program in terms of the CEFR. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 15(3), 1171-1187.