



PROFESSIONALISM AND PROFESSIONAL LEARNING SITUATIONS OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHERS IN TURKEY

Nafiye Nur Meşe^{a *}, Birsen Bağçeci^b, Emrah Cinkara^c

^{a,b,c} Gaziantep University, Faculty of Education, Turkey

Received: 27.03.2023

Revised version received: 01.06.2023

Accepted: 03.06.2023

Abstract

This research aims to describe the professionalism and professional learning situations of English language teachers in Turkey. In the present study quantitative research design was adopted and the relational survey model is used within the scope of the general scanning survey model. The sample of the study is 354 English teachers working in public schools in Gaziantep (including all its districts) in the 2021-2022 academic year. The data were collected via two scales. The first scale is the "Teaching Profession Professionalism Scale" that was used to determine the professionalism level of English teachers in Turkey. The second scale is the Teacher Professional Learning Scale, which was used in order to measure in which areas and to what extent teachers learn. In the analysis of the data frequency analyzes were applied for descriptive statistics, according to the sub-questions of the research, the data were analyzed using the Independent sample t-test, one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) and correlation coefficients, and the findings were interpreted. The results revealed that there is a positive moderate correlation between the Professional learning scale and the professionalism scale scores of the teachers. The results showed that teachers need developmental programs for both professional learning and professionalism. It is hoped that the study will shed light on the related professional group and the aims and practices of English language teaching of the National Education policy.

Keywords: Professionalism, Professional learning, Teacher professionalism, English language Teachers

© 2021 IJETS & the Authors. Published by *International Journal of Education Technology and Science (IJETS)*. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC BY-NC-ND) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

* This article consists of a part of the doctoral dissertation being conducted under the supervision of Prof. Dr. Birsen Bağçeci.

*Corresponding author: Nafiye Nur Meşe. ORCID ID.: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7006-039X>
E-mail: nurmeseg@gmail.com

1. Introduction

Along with the rapid formation of the information, change and development in the global system, political, cultural, social and technological developments, the educational needs of individuals also show rapid change and development. Therefore, in direct connection with the increase in the importance and expectations given to education and training, the expectations and demands of teachers who have a high impact rate on learning outcomes have also increased. In the education system, which aims to raise individuals who are compatible with the changing and developing world conditions, teachers cannot be expected to serve only with the knowledge and experience they have gained during their undergraduate graduation. At this point, it is important for teachers to develop their professional knowledge and skills, to be aware of the changes and developments in their fields, and to keep up with these changes and developments in teaching, as in many occupational groups. Teachers' awareness of this issue and their action towards it means that they should work towards professionalization in the profession. Awareness of how professional a teacher sees himself and the importance and necessity of dealing with professionalism can be realized individually as well as with the support and encouragement of the education system. Although education systems determine teachers' general and field competencies, these competencies are often limited to definitions. However, beyond the definitions, the extent to which these competencies are functionally reflected in the practice and how much they are realized by the teachers, who are the target audience, can of course be much more important.

In recent years, in addition to different occupational groups such as health and service sectors, the professionalism of teachers and/or the necessity of professionalization has started to be mentioned frequently in the education sector. When the relevant literature is examined, many studies have been conducted and are being conducted in Turkey as in other countries, in which the professionalization of teachers and even teacher candidates, their perception of professionalism, their perspective on professionalization, the relationship between professionalism and many different factors are tried to be determined or described. When the studies on professionalization in education in Turkey in recent years are examined, it is seen that there are many studies given below on a yearly basis. To give an outline, the researchers examined the following issues in their studies: Bayhan (2011), taking the definitions of professionalism and professionalism in a broad scope, the professionalism of teachers; Cerit (2012), the relationship between the bureaucratic structure of the school and the professional behavior of classroom teachers; Uzun, Paliç, and Akdeniz (2013), science and technology teachers' perceptions of professional teaching; Yılmaz and Altınkurt (2014) developed the Teachers' Professional Professionalism Scale, which is seen to be frequently used in the related literature; Karaca (2015), the interaction between the level of bureaucratization and

teacher professionalism; Temiz (2016), the opinions of classroom teachers on professionalization in the profession; Yirci (2017), obstacles in front of teacher professionalism and solutions for these obstacles; Eroğlu, Erdoğan, and Özbek (2018), the relationship between teachers' professional professionalism and their attitudes towards professional development; Doğan (2019), Religious Culture and Moral Education Teaching and Professionalism; Çetin and Özalp (2019), vocational high school teachers' perceptions of teacher professionalism and teacher leadership; Karnak (2020), the relationship between teachers' professionalism and organizational happiness; Zembat and İlçi Küsmüş (2020) examined or discussed the relationship between preschool teachers' classroom management skills and their professional professionalism.

When the studies mentioned above and the literature review are examined in detail, it is seen that although there are studies on different branches and disciplines, no due diligence, examination or research has been carried out on the professionalization of English teachers as a branch itself in Turkey. For this reason, this research will be a first in the literature in terms of including the evaluations of English teachers on professionalization in Turkey. This study is important in terms of raising awareness and guiding the Turkish National Education System and, of course, the main heroes of foreign language education -English teachers- , as it is the first study in the literature and will deal with professionalism in teaching in a comprehensive and predictive way by reducing it to the branch level. With this respect, the research question of the study is whether there is a relationship between professionalism and the professional learning status of English teachers in the teaching profession in Turkey or not.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Profession

Teaching is not just a channel in the process of transferring academic knowledge to individuals, or a profession limited only to the school and classroom environment. Teaching is a professional group that is expected to be in a continuous and exemplary relationship and interaction with both the parents of the students in the target group, as well as the society and the social field outside the school. Due to this feature, it is known that the teaching profession has more importance and influence than the effects of other professional groups on individuals. Hacıoğlu (1997) also defines the teaching profession as a profession in professional status, which has social, cultural, economic, scientific and technological dimensions related to the education sector, requires academic study and life formation based on special expertise knowledge and skills in the field.

When a broader definition is sought, Oğuzkan's (1993) definition of teaching is remarkable: A person who has obtained the authority to teach by completing the education required by the teaching profession or by gaining the qualifications. Bakioğlu (2017) states that teaching, like other professions, meets the characteristics of being a profession. According to her, the indicator of this is the main features of the teaching profession. It includes the main factors such as high-level education on the basis of special knowledge, selection process in recruitment, and the understanding of service to students and society.

As a fact, every education system determines the human model it will train in the light of its education philosophy and manpower policy and organizes educational activities according to this purpose. Today, when the teaching profession is wanted to be defined, it is seen that teaching can be defined in a much broader scope than it has been before. In the changing and developing world, education systems and expectations especially from teachers - the main elements of these systems- are also changing. Although it is the basic prerequisite for teachers for being appointed to the relevant field, it is no longer very important in the teaching literature for a teacher to have a bachelor's degree in the relevant field, but also it is important how much a teacher contributes to himself and his students in his profession over the years. In fact, in most cases, teachers can be expected to have interdisciplinary knowledge and equipment: a good communicator who knows sometimes psychology and sometimes sociology, understands the values and judgments of the country they live in and especially the region they work in, is aware of technological and scientific developments in the field, etc. Schools not only need a sufficient number of teachers, but also need teachers who are talented, committed to their profession, aware of the expectations of the society and the system and trying to realize them (Oğuzkan, 1998).

Teacher Professional Learning

Professional development is one of the key elements in the process of raising standards and increasing social growth capacity by developing policies and practices in education (Evans, 2008). Teacher professional learning (TPL) encourages the development of new ways of thinking about content and new approaches to teaching by helping teachers gain professional knowledge and insights. Thus, a change occurs in teachers' existing beliefs and attitudes. Professional development contributes positively to the learning and teaching process by reflecting on student success in the long run.

Teachers must continually evolve throughout their careers to remain an important factor in their students' learning processes. Professional learning can help teachers develop the content knowledge and skills they need to be successful in their classrooms. By improving their skills and knowledge, teachers become more ready to make curriculum and instructional decisions (Wilfried et al., 2016).

Much of the literature on teacher professional learning is based on the idea that effective professional learning will improve teachers' teaching practices those are resulting in better student learning (Cordingley 2015; Desimone 2006). Although the lists of characteristics of effective professional learning in the related literature differ in terms of content and length, Opfer and Pedder (2011) grouped the features that professional learning activities should have in three areas. Accordingly, learning activities should be: intensive and continuous, integrated into teaching practice and be collaborative and collective.

Research on teacher professional learning shows that teacher professional learning is focused on actively and reflectively participating in teaching practice. Teacher professional learning can be realized much more effectively when teachers are engaged in practice materials and schoolbased learning activities; participate in their daily work by themselves and learn in accordance with their own contexts; take part in action research or are engaged in action research and take place in individual studies (Borko 2004; Cordingley 2015; Garet et al. 2001; Wayne et al. 2008; Cullen, Akerson and Hanson 2010). The place and importance of teacher communities in effective professional learning is also mentioned in the literature. It is stated that collaborative and collective work contributes to providing more suitable and sustainable conditions for professional learning, improving teaching and school practices, and individual teacher development (Bubb and Earley, 2009; Garet et al. 2001; Wayne et al. 2008; Darling-Hammond and Bransford, 2005; Achinstein, 2002; Grossman, Wineburg, and Woolworth, 2001; Piazza, McNeill, and Hittinger, 2009).

Hassel (1999, cited in Kent, 2004) defines professional development as the process of improving teachers' skills and abilities to produce outstanding teaching outcomes for their students. The aim of professional development practices is to provide the highest contribution to the realization of the profession, starting with the individuals' new learning and experiences.

As a result of direct communication and interaction with students and colleagues, the new knowledge and skills acquired by teachers in the professional development process can be reflected in the whole of education and training and can play a supporting role as added value in the improvement and development of standards in education and training.

One of the reasons why professional development has an important place in the professional processes of teachers is that, professional development studies provide teachers with the opportunity to get to know new teaching practices and methods for renewed curricula in addition to the teaching practices they have used and known for years. Thus, professional development studies that shed light on renewing the feelings of curiosity, desire to learn, professional motivation and satisfaction in teachers remind them that there are new opportunities to get rid of the monotony that has occurred over the years. Teachers who

experience these feelings tend to be open to continuous development both individually and professionally by following the literature and their environment more during the learning process. Teachers are not satisfied with what is available anymore, but they start to act along with the questions as "What else can be done? How can more contribution be made?" and thus devote more time to their professional development in order to develop better teaching strategies. Wested (2000) states that professional development does not only focus on the teacher by putting student learning at the center, but also includes all school members; focuses on colleague cooperation and organization as well as individuals. It provides teachers with the opportunity to develop expertise and reach high standards in other elements such as teaching strategies and the use of technology, as well as content knowledge, encourage teachers to constantly question and progress, and it is carried out as a long-term plan in time.

Drawing attention to the importance of effective teachers in the 21st century, Stronge (2002) states that education and training must develop in order to be up-to-date in parallel with the changes in other sectors. The transition to the knowledge economy necessitates the need for quality and especially teacher quality of education systems in many respects. It should not be forgotten that the nations with the best schools and the best teachers and school administrators will have the future in this change. It is important that the young population is well educated, as the system is competitive and highly interrelated and interacting directly. Teachers should prepare all students to receive world-class welcomes, reduce achievement gaps and social inequality, and serve as the nexus for educational reforms (Cochran-Smith & Villegas, 2015).

2.2. Teacher Professionalism

Teachers should be professionally competent at schools, follow the innovations and technology in the field of education, use different methods and techniques in education by considering the needs and learning levels of the students, be able to communicate well and accurately with colleagues and students and seeks to learn in various ways.

It is important to understand what it means to be a professional teacher, as the foundation of an educated society is built on teachers who interact with students from their early childhood to young adulthood. Darling-Hammond (1996) states that the invention of 21st century schools that can educate all children well is based, above all, on the development of a highly qualified and determined teaching force. The realization of the necessity of qualified teachers for the realization of qualified teaching has also been reflected in the studies on teachers in the literature. Particularly since the first half of the 1990s, a paradigmatic change has occurred in research and practices on teachers, and it has begun to focus on the practice world of teachers- professionalism, knowledge, action research, reflective thinking, practice, etc. In addition, since these years, there has been an understanding that researches

should be carried out "with teachers" as well as researches "on" teachers, and researches on this subject have been carried out (Ekiz, 2006).

Professionalization of teaching is encouraged in many countries around the world, with a strong emphasis primarily on the professionalism of teachers as one of the critical elements of professionalisation. Because it is assumed that professionalism can provide the quality of education as well as the quality of training. Although great efforts have been made to promote the professionalism of teachers in many countries, it is seen that the definition of professional teacher and the attitudes and behaviors that a professional teacher should exhibit are handled in different ways. In the business world, "professional" is often synonymous with "successful" or at least refers to the behavior expected of individuals in certain occupations. In the teaching profession, on the other hand, it is a complex process that includes the historical development, philosophy of life, socio-cultural characteristics and economic conditions of the society within the professionalization process. Because of this feature, the responsibilities and roles attributed to teachers also include a challenging process that should not be taken lightly. At the most basic level, the definition of "professional teacher" refers to the status of a person who is paid to teach. However, a more advanced definition of professional teacher can refer to teachers who represent the best in the profession and set the highest standard for best practice (Tichenor & Tichenor, 2005). Clement (2002) and Seifert (1999) point out that becoming a professional teacher is a process that takes time to master. Sockett (1993), on the other hand, talks about the moral foundations of professionalism in teaching and defines professionalism as "the way of behavior in a profession, how members combine their obligations with their knowledge and skills in the context of the professional association, and their ethical relations with the sector they serve". According to Phelps (2003), professionalism means that teachers fully accept the challenges of the teaching job. In his work titled "The Three Rs of Professionalism", he tries to explain the three basic indicators that make up professionalism. These are: responsibility, respect and risk taking. These three elements (responsibility, respect, and risk-taking), which professionalism defines as Three Rs, help teachers better understand professionalism, and teachers' behavior based on these three values is associated with their more professionalism. Reflection and dialogue provides a way for teachers to explore the extent or shortcomings of their own professionalism. As teachers try to respond with respect, take responsibility and take risks, their individual professionalism will develop. The teaching practice, which covers the complex dimensions of teaching through the four main components that Danielson (2007) presented to the literature, is not limited to a single teaching approach or model, but supports teachers to take "Professional Responsibilities". In their description of professionalism, Swisher and Page (2005) mention that professionalism expresses internalized beliefs. These beliefs may be related to teachers' professional obligations, qualifications, interactions with colleagues and educational environment, attitudes, values and role behaviors.

Kramer (2003) seeks an answer to the question of what are the elements required by professionalism in his study titled "ABC of Professionalism" and identifies three categories that he sees as the most important of these elements: attitude, behavior and communication. Finally, Hurst and Reding (2000) emphasize that professionals should follow developments in their fields closely. This means that teachers should be lifelong learners. According to Wong and Wong (1998), a professional feels responsible for his work without any supervision or rule. He is a person who has a continuous personal and professional development plan to reach proficiency and strives to take the learning level of each student group he teaches to the next level. Sockett (1993), on the other hand, is based on five important aspects that he identified for teacher professionalism: character, commitment to change and continuous improvement, subject knowledge, pedagogical knowledge and assignments and working relationships outside the classroom. These categories cover a wide variety of aspects of professionalism and effectiveness. The first of the categories determined by Sockett (1993) regarding teacher professionalism is character. A teacher's character expresses personal virtues such as patience, determination, courage and respect for children. Claiming that we often ignore the importance of character by focusing on the performance of the teaching act, Sockett (1993) states that he believes it is impossible to separate the teacher's character from the teaching act. The second category of teacher professionalism is commitment to change and continuous improvement. Stating that trying to adapt to change seems inevitable for a professional, the reason for this is the thought that the children in the class will always be different from the previous group. It emphasizes that teachers who are committed to change and continuous improvement will constantly be looking for ways to improve their practices and adapt to the individual needs of students. The third category describing teacher professionalism is subject knowledge; the fourth category is pedagogical knowledge and the last category is assignments and working relationships outside the classroom. Sockett (1993) states that teachers have wide responsibilities and relationships, including collaborating with professionals, taking on a wider role at school, and including colleagues and parents, while fulfilling their teaching role inside and outside the classroom, and draws attention to the need for teaching to go beyond performance and activities in the classroom. Therefore, as can be understood from different definitions, professionalism in teaching is an element that needs to be examined and predicted in a very broad scope.

3. Method

3.1. Research Design

In this study, one of the quantitative research methods, the relational survey model is used within the scope of the general scanning survey model. The scanning survey model is defined as all the processes applied for the realization of learning and the development of desired

behaviors in the individual, describing a past or present situation as it exists (Karasar, 1998). In the relational survey model, in which it is tried to determine whether the variables change together and if there is a change, it is aimed to determine the existence of a change between two or more variables (Karasar, 1998). The relational survey model is used to identify or compare interactions between multiple variables through various statistical techniques. In relational survey models, the relations between variables can be obtained in two ways: correlation type and comparison type. In correlation type relational surveys, it is tried to determine whether the variables change together or not, if there is a change together, how this happens (Karasar, 1998).

3.2. *Population*

Since the aim of the research is to describe the professionalization and professional learning situations of English teachers in Turkey, the universe of the research is "English teachers working in public (National Education Public Schools) schools in Turkey". Quantitative studies collect data from representative samples with the characteristics of the research population in order to generalize their findings. In this large universe, within the framework of the principle of convenience and accessibility, the researcher chose the sampling method specific to the province of Gaziantep, where she resides. The sample of the research is 2900 English teachers working in public schools in Gaziantep (including all its districts) in the 2021-2022 academic year. However, not all English teachers working in the specified year were included in the sample, and English teachers working as administrative managers were excluded from the research group. The number of English teachers participating in the research from the specified sample is 354.

3.3. *Research instruments*

Two different scales were used in the study. The first scale is the "Teaching Profession Professionalism Scale" developed by Ilgan, Aslanargün, and Shaukar (2015) to determine the professionalism level of English teachers in Turkey. The second scale is the Teacher Professional Learning Scale, which was developed by Liu, Hallinger, and Feng (2016) and adapted to Turkish by Gümüş, Apaydın, and Bellibaş (2018) in order to measure in which areas and to what extent teachers learn.

The "Teaching Profession Professionalism Scale" developed by Ilgan, Aslanargün and Shaukar (2015) was developed in five-point Likert type and consists of nine dimensions: "teacher quality and professional sensitivity, professional perception of the public and senior management, professional commitment, having high level knowledge and skills. , professional discipline, professional development, the Public Confidence in the Profession, perception of the importance of the profession, and professional autonomy. The number of items in the scale

is 46. The Cronba alpha internal reliability coefficient for the whole scale is .93, and the Cronbach's Alpha internal consistency coefficients of the sub-dimensions of the scale are: factor loads in the dimension of teacher quality and professional sensitivity .91, factor loads in the dimension of professional perception of the public and senior management .82, factor loads in the dimension of professional commitment. .87, factor loads in the dimension of having high-level knowledge and skills .67, factor loads in the dimension of professional discipline .76, factor loads in the dimension of professional development .66, factor loads in the dimension of public and profession trust .68, factor loads in the dimension of perception of the importance of the profession factor loadings are .56 and .70 for professional autonomy dimension.

The Teacher Professional Learning Scale, developed by Liu, Hallinger and Feng (2016) and adapted to Turkish by Gümüş, Apaydın, and Bellibaş (2018), is a five-point Likert type and consists of a total of 27 items. The scale consists of four dimensions: the “collaboration” dimension, which aims to measure the level of cooperation between teachers with other teachers in order to share, discuss and evaluate their teaching activities; the “reflection” dimension, which involves teachers using feedback from students and teachers and observing other teachers to improve their teaching methods; the "practice" dimension, which includes the development of different materials and their applications in the classroom to solve the problems that teachers encounter in the education and training process, and the "access to the knowledge base" dimension, which consists of items about the extent to which teachers use different resources to improve their teaching processes.

In the analyses, the Cronbach's alpha coefficient for the Turkish version of the scale is .92. In the analyzes made for each of the 4 dimensions that make up the scale, Cronbach's alpha values, which are the internal consistency coefficients, were found above .77. The Cronbach's alpha coefficient was .82 for the 'cooperation dimension'; .83 for 'projection size'; .85 for the 'application' dimension and .77 for the 'access to the knowledge base' dimension. When the Cronbach alpha coefficients obtained for the dimensions are examined, it is seen that the reliability of all dimensions is at a sufficient level.

In this study, reliability analyzes of the scales were also performed, and Cronbach's alpha values for both scales were found to be quite high.

Table 1. Reliability Analysis of Data Collection Tools

	Number of items	Cronbach's Alfa
Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale	46	0,944

Teachers' Professional Learning Scale

27

0,955

3.4. Data Collection Procedure

The instructions for both data collection tools that are intended to be used in the data collection process of the research were created online (on an information network) through the Google documents application, after obtaining the relevant application permissions (permission of the expert who developed the scale, Ministry of National Education and Gaziantep University Educational Sciences Institute), access link and the relevant application permit documents were sent to Gaziantep Provincial Directorate of National Education and the application was started. Participants were given one month for the application. At the end of this period, the number of participants included in the application is 354. In the first part of the data collection application, a short briefing was given to the participants about the research subject and they were reminded that they had promised to keep their personal data confidential. In the personal information form, information such as gender, age, education level, type of program graduated, years of service and education level were requested from the participants.

3.5. Analysis of data

Statistical Package for the Social Sciences 25 (SPSS-25) package program was used for data analysis in the study. First, the reliability coefficients of the data were determined, and then normality tests and statistics were used to control the normality of the distribution of the data. In the study, it was observed that the data were normally distributed, and accordingly parametric statistical tests were used. In the study, frequency analyzes were applied for descriptive statistics, according to the sub-questions of the research, the data were analyzed using the Independent sample t-test, one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) and correlation coefficients, and the findings were interpreted. In statistical interpretations, the significance value was taken as <0.05 .

4. Results

4.1. Demographic Data of Respondents

Table 2. Demographic Data of Respondents

		n	%
Gender	Female	279	78,8
	Male	75	21,2

Age	21-30 years	70	19,8
	31-40 years	154	43,5
	41-50 years	100	28,2
	51 and more	30	8,5
Educational status	Bachelor degree	302	85,3
	Postgraduate	52	14,7
Graduated program	English Teacher	247	69,8
	English Language and Literature	71	20,1
	Others	36	10,2
Year of seniority	1-5 years	65	18,4
	6-10 years	75	21,2
	11-15 years	64	18,1
	16-20 years	79	22,3
	21 and more	71	20,1
Level of Education Served	Primary school	68	19,2
	Secondary school	131	37,0
	High school	155	43,8

The distribution of personal information of the participants is given in the table. Accordingly, 78.8% of the participants are female and 21.2% are male. 43.5% of the participants are between the ages of 31-40. 85.3% of the respondents have a bachelor's degree. 69.8% of the participants are graduates of English Language Teaching. 22.3% of the respondents have a seniority of 16-20 years. Finally, 43.8% of the participants teach at high school.

4.2. *The professionalism of English teachers in the teaching profession in Turkey*

In order to find an answer to the research question of the study whether there is a relationship between professionalism and the professional learning status of English teachers in the teaching profession in Turkey or not, the following statistical studies are held and the results are as follows:

Table 3. The Correlation between the scales (Teaching Profession Professionalism Scale and Teacher Professional Learning Scale)

		Collaboration	Reflection	Practice	Access to the knowledge base	Teacher Professional Learning Scale
Teacher quality and professional sensitivity	r	,493**	,445**	,425**	,397**	,498**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Professional perception of the public and senior management	r	,259**	,225**	,227**	,234**	,266**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Professional commitment	r	,316**	,349**	,327**	,266**	,358**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Having high level knowledge and skills	r	,470**	,406**	,402**	,397**	,472**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Professional discipline	r	,350**	,326**	,320**	,241**	,350**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Professional Development	r	,493**	,565**	,597**	,624**	,639**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Public Confidence in the Profession	r	,191**	,165**	,144**	,111*	,175**
	p	0,000	0,002	0,007	0,037	0,001
Perception of the importance of the profession	r	,355**	,296**	,326**	,291**	,355**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Professional autonomy	r	,226**	,216**	,235**	,238**	,256**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000
Teaching Profession Professionalism Scale	r	,507**	,476**	,470**	,436**	,534**
	p	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000	0,000

The table shows the results of the correlation test of the scales and their sub-dimensions. According to Pearson correlation coefficients, 0-0.25 means very weak, 0.26-0.49 weak, 0.50-0.69 medium, 0.70-0.89 high, 0.90-1.00 very high correlation (Yazıcıoğlu & Erdoğan, 2014). The results can be summarized as:

a. Collaboration:

There is a weak positive correlation between the Collaboration sub-dimension score and the Teacher Quality and Professional Sensitivity; the Professional Commitment; High Level Knowledge and Skills; the Professional Discipline; the Professional Development and the Perception of the Importance of the Profession sub-dimension scores.

There is a very weak positive correlation between the Collaboration sub-dimension score and the Professional Perception of the Public and Senior Management; the Public Confidence in the Profession and the Professional Autonomy sub-dimension scores.

There is a positive and moderate relationship between the Collaboration sub-dimension score and the Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale score.

b. Reflection:

There is a weak positive correlation between the Reflection sub-dimension score and the Teacher Quality and Professional Sensitivity; the Professional Commitment; Having High Level Knowledge and Skills and the Perception of the Importance of the Profession sub-dimension scores.

There is a very weak positive correlation between the reflection sub-dimension score and the Professional Perception of the Public and Senior Management; the Professional Discipline; the Public Confidence in the Profession and the Professional Autonomy sub-dimension scores.

There is a moderate positive relationship between the Reflection sub-dimension score and the Professional Development sub-dimension score.

There is a weak positive correlation between the Reflection sub-dimension score and the Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale score.

c. Practice:

There is a weak positive correlation between the Practice sub-dimension score and the Teacher Quality and Professional Sensitivity; the Professional Commitment; the Possession of High Level Knowledge and Skills; the Professional Discipline and the Perception of the Importance of the Profession sub-dimension scores.

There is a very weak positive correlation between the Practice sub-dimension score and the Professional Perception of the Public and Senior Management; the Public Confidence in the Profession and and the Professional Autonomy sub-dimension scores.

There is a positive and moderate relationship between the Practice sub-dimension score and the Professional Development sub-dimension score.

There is a weak positive correlation between the Practice sub-dimension score and the Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale score.

d. Access to the knowledge base:

There is a weak positive correlation between the Access to Knowledge Base sub-dimension score and the Teacher Quality and Professional Sensitivity; the Professional Commitment; the Having High Level Knowledge and Skills and the Perception of the Importance of the Profession sub-dimension score.

There is a very weak positive correlation between the Access to Knowledge Base sub-dimension score and the Professional Perception of the Public and Senior Management; the Professional Discipline; the Public Confidence in the Profession and the Professional Autonomy sub-dimension scores.

There is a moderate positive relationship between the Access to Knowledge Base sub-dimension score and the Professional Development sub-dimension score.

There is a weak positive correlation between the Access to Knowledge Base sub-dimension score and the Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale score.

e. Teacher Professional Learning Scale

There is a weak positive correlation between Teacher Professional Learning Scale score and Teacher Quality and Professional Sensitivity; the Professional Commitment; the Possession of High Level Knowledge and Skills; the Professional Discipline and the Perception of the Importance of the Profession sub-dimension scores.

There is a very weak positive correlation between Teacher Professional Learning Scale score and the Professional Perception of the Public and Senior Management; the Public Confidence in the Profession and Professional Autonomy sub-dimension scores.

There is a positive and moderate relationship between Teacher Professional Learning Scale score and the Professional Development sub-dimension score.

There is a positive and moderate relationship between Teacher Professional Learning Scale score and the Teacher Profession Professionalism Scale score.

5. Discussion and Conclusion

This research was carried out with the participation of 354 teachers and the relationship between "teachers' professionalism" and "teachers' professional learning" was examined, and comments on the results of the findings obtained as a result of the analyzes are presented below.

According to the results of the research, it was determined that the professional learning perceptions and professionalism perceptions of teachers were generally affected positively and moderately. When the relations between the sub-dimensions of each of the

scales are examined positive, weak or very weak correlations were found between the cooperation dimension score, which is the sub-dimension of the professional learning scale and the professionalism sub-dimensions.

Collaboration is a very important professional requirement in terms of the teaching profession, both as learning communities and as professionalism. Darling-Hammond (2005) also mentioned the importance of teachers' collaboration as a team within the professional activities that the modern teacher's view accepts at the school level and that they think it affects the learning environment in the school. Hargreaves and Elhawary (2019), who draw attention to the importance of collaborative learning in professional learning, also state that teachers' collaborative work will help them improve their learning pedagogy, instructional skills and qualifications.

The fact that the collaboration dimension is positively and moderately related to the professional professionalism dimension indicates that the teachers have a professional approach, but they either see themselves as inadequate and limit themselves in areas such as confidence in the profession, the importance given to the profession, discipline, or the negative factors they encounter in their environment. Concerns about the status of the profession suggest that there are negative influences from inside or outside the profession. Muyan (2013) shared the conclusion that teachers find collaborative professional development activities moderately important in his thesis study on English teachers' perceptions of professional development activities. The researcher stated that this result may be due to the fact that teachers do not have sufficient knowledge about cooperative learning activities or that their working conditions may prevent them from practicing such activities. In addition, although teachers have cooperation skills, working conditions, school culture or administrative practices may affect their level of cooperation, so the relationship between cooperation sub-dimension and other sub-dimensions may be affected.

It has been observed that there is a positive and moderate relationship between the reflection sub-dimension in the professional learning scale and the professionalism scale. As in the other dimension, there is a positive but weakly effective relationship between the reflection sub-dimension and the professionalism sub-dimensions. The ability to reflect is one of the factors that can affect teachers' professional development. The ability to reflect has positive effects on both the environment and the practitioner in the learning process within professional practices. According to Dalgıç (2012, p.15), reflective practice is defined as a deep thinking process aimed at making sense of and improving the past, present and future actions of the individual by gaining awareness on his/her behaviors, experiences, what he/she heard and observed from his/her environment, and analyzing them. It can be thought that the low level of effects of teachers' reflection ability on professionalism may be due to the fact

that both fields are complex and related to many factors. Safari et al. (2020) found a very low correlation of .08, which is far from the estimates, in their research, which aimed to simultaneously investigate the relationships between the variables of self-efficacy, job satisfaction, and reflective thinking and the effects of these variables on professional development. Researchers interpreted this situation as not only reflective thinking affects professional development, but professional development is also affected by reflective thinking. Since the act of reflection includes teachers' own repertoire, professional practices, and evaluations, it also makes us think that teachers stay away from a critical approach.

It has been observed that there is a positive and weak relationship between the practice sub-dimension in the professional learning scale and the professionalism scale and its sub-dimensions. Although the positive relationship is evaluated as significant, it is noteworthy that the professionalism relationship of the practice sub-dimension, which is the main area of the teaching profession, is weak in general. Practice is related to the effectiveness of teachers in the classroom in the educational process. The fact that the application result is weak suggests that it is more related to other factors required by professionalism - such as autonomy, discipline, self-confidence, and its effects are reflected negatively. However, Shantz and Prieur (1996) define professionalism as people's awareness of developments in their fields and their ability to make practices by adapting to these developments. Bodur (2006) also states that a member of the profession should know and apply the requirements of the profession in order to be successful in his/her job and achieve satisfaction.

Similarly, there is a positive and weak relationship between the Access to Knowledge Base sub-dimension score and the professionalism scale and its sub-dimensions. Although the positive aspect of the relationship shows that it is related to professionalism, it is obvious that this situation is quite remarkable considering the necessity of accessing the knowledge base in today's system is of vital importance in terms of professional development and learning. It is thought that the possible reasons for this result may be the negative effects of factors such as existing infrastructure of the institutions or problems with the technology infrastructure, the teachers' lack of time and motivation. Richards (2002) pointed out that language teachers are expected to have knowledge about the subject, students and teaching methodology so that they can adapt theories to their practices and develop appropriate tools for teaching and assessment. Bayhan (2011) also states in her research that the positive opinion of teachers that they get help from their colleagues when they need is quite high. Again, Bayhan (2011) in the same study shares that the use of technology was accepted by the majority of the participants as a contributing factor in the professionalization of teachers.

A positive moderate correlation was found between the Professional learning scale and the professionalism scale scores of the teachers. The development of professional learning level positively affects professional professionalism. Therefore, it is thought that professional

learning is an effective factor in other sub-dimensions. The variables with which professional learning is most associated or positively effective are professional development and professional commitment, while other factors may have less influence. The findings show that professionalism can also improve with more support for teachers' professional development. Altun and Cengiz (2012) stated that the schools where teachers work do not offer sufficient opportunities for their professional development, the professional development activities offered are not practical and hinder their professional development and also the financial inadequacies of schools and the lack of cooperation between teachers constitute an important obstacle to the development of teachers. Karaarslan (2003) also emphasized that some of the obstacles to professional development of teachers are excessive workload, lack of self-motivation and lack of institutional support.

6. Recommendations

The results showed that teachers need developmental programs for both professional learning and professionalism. Changing and evolving educational issues require teachers to be well equipped and develop their capacity to cope with the many changes and challenges they face. Due to the acceptance of education as a life-long process in our age, the training of teachers is not seen as limited to pre-service training, and when they start their profession, teachers need to be trained through some training activities organized by the institutions they work for, and the teacher should develop himself/herself (Şişman, 1999).

In terms of teachers' professional development it is necessary to determine the needs in each subject, to prepare training programs, to develop seminars and practices for professional learning. Teachers show individual differences due to reasons such as the education they receive, the socio-economic level of the institution they work for or their personality traits. For this reason, while designing professional development activities, a correct needs analysis should be done by taking these differences into account, and teachers should be given the right to choose professional development activities from among many options in line with their needs and interests. For the development of teachers' cooperation skills, programming activities to improve cooperation between teachers and joint studies can be provided. Through the plans of the school administration and/or education policies to encourage cooperation, it can contribute to the development of teachers' cooperation skills, thus opening their practices and knowledge to others, reflecting and sharing rich practice experiences. Mentoring programs can be used to realize the goals of cooperation, practice, reflection and professional learning. Thus, professional guidance such as modeling effective teaching strategies, meeting new ideas and skills, and receiving constructive feedback can be provided to new teachers and teachers with little experience.

It may be beneficial to receive feedback and develop new programs in order to understand and improve the operability of professional development programs implemented in

schools. Special practices and programs can be created to support teachers' professional learning and professionalism approaches. The OECD (n.d.) report highlights the need for enhanced connectivity and collaboration between educational institutions, local authorities and schools so that continuing professional development can better meet teachers' learning needs.

Resources and trainings can be organized in order to use the developing technology and information resources more competently. Curtain and Pesola (1994) state that foreign language teachers need an unprecedented level of competence and infrastructure in their preparation, and strong professional development is important at this point.

Since the results show that the relationship between "teachers' professionalism" and "teachers' professional learning" is weak, this issue should be evaluated with a more comprehensive research perspective and causal relationships should be revealed. Conducting research to understand the source of the weak effect that emerged as a result of the research can be a guide in determining the changes made in education policies and practices, especially in recent years.

References

- Achinstein, B. 2002. “Conflict Amid Community: The Micropolitics of Teacher Collaboration.” *Teacher College Record* 104 (3), 421–455.
- Altun, T. and Cengiz, E. (2012). Upper Primary School Teachers' Views about Professional Development Opportunities. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 4 (3), 672-690.
- Bakioğlu, A. (Editör) et al. Bayhan, G., Ülker, N., Koç, H., Özgen, B. (2017). Öğretmenlerin Mesleki Profesyonel Hayatları, Nobel Akademik Yayıncılık Eğitim Danışmanlık Tic. Ltd Şti., I. Basım, Ankara, 2017.
- Bayhan, G. (2011). Öğretmenlerin Profesyonelliğinin İncelenmesi. Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü. Unpublished doctoral dissertation.
- Bayhan, G. & Dalgıç, G. (2012). School dropout according to the views of high school leavers. *İnönü University Journal of Faculty of Education*, 13 (3), 107-130.
- BERA-RSA. (2014b). Research and the teaching profession: Building the capacity for a self-improving education system. Final report of the BERA-RSA inquiry into the role of research in teacher education. London. <https://www.bera.ac.uk>, BERA-RSA-Research-Teaching-Profession-FULL-REPORT-for-web.pdf, access date: 18.05.2021
- Borko, H. (2004). Professional Development and Teacher Learning: Mapping the Terrain. *Educational Researcher* 33 (8), 3–15.
- Bubb, S. & P. Earley. (2009). Leading Staff Development for School Improvement. *School Leadership & Management: Formerly School Organization* 29 (1), 23–37.
- Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (CERI) (1998). *Staying Ahead: In-service Training and Teacher Professional Development*. OECD Publishing
- Cerit, Y.(2012). Okulun Bürokratik yapısı ile Sınıf Öğretmenlerinin Profesyonel Davranışları Arasındaki İlişki. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi*, 18 (4), 497-521.
- Clement, L. (2002). Welcome to a profession. *New Teacher Advocate*, 10(2), 4. <http://digital.watkinsprinting.com/publication>. Erişim: 29.05.2022
- Cochran-Smith, M & Villegas, A. M. (2015). Studying Teacher Preparation: The questions that drive research. *European Educational Research Journal*, 14 (5), 379-394.
- Cordingley, P. (2015). The Contribution of Research to Teachers’ Professional Learning and Development. *Oxford Review of Education* 41 (2), 234–252.
- Cullen, T. A., V. L. Akerson, and D. L. Hanson. 2010. Using Action Research to Engage K-6 Teachers in Nature of Science Inquiry as Professional Development. *Journal of Science Teacher Education* 21 (8): 971–992.

- Curtain, H., & Pesola, C. (1994). *Languages and children: Making the match*. White Plains, NY: Longman.
- Çelikten, M. & Kocabaş, İ. (2000). Türkiye’de Öğretmen İstihdamı. Erciyes Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 9, 273.
- Çetin, M. & Özalp, U. (2019). Meslek lisesi Öğretmenlerinin Öğretmen Profesyonelliği ve Öğretmen Liderliğine İlişkin Algılarının İncelenmesi. Anemon Muş Alparslan Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 7, 193-213.
- Danielson, C. (2007). *Enhancing professional practice: A framework for teaching*, 2nd Edition. Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data. ISBN-10: 1416605177.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (1996). The quiet revolution: Rethinking teacher development. Educational Leadership, 53(6), 4–10.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2005). Teaching as a Profession: Lessons in Teacher Preparation and Professional Development. Sage Journals. 87 (3), 237- 255.
- Desimone, L. M., Smith, T. M. & Ueno, K. (2006). Are teachers who need sustained, content-focused Professional development getting it? An Administrator’s Dilemma. Educational Administration Quarterly. 42 (2), 179-215.
- Doğan, S. (2019). Din Kültürü ve Ahlak Bilgisi Öğretmenliği ve Profesyonellik. İnönü Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü. Unpublished MA thesis.
- Ekiz, D. (2006). *Öğretmen Eğitimi ve Öğretimde Yaklaşımlar*. 1. Basım, Nobel Yayın.
- Eroğlu, M., Erdoğan, U. & Özbek, R. (2018). Öğretmenlerin Mesleki Profesyonellikleriyle Mesleki Gelişime Yönelik Tutumları Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi. Journal of Humanities and Sciences Research, 5 (30), 4379-4388.
- Evans, L. (2008). Professionalism, professionalism and the development of education professionals. British Journal of Educational Studies, Volume: 56, 20–38.
- Garet, M., A. Porter, C. Andrew, & L. Desimone. (2001). What Makes Professional Development Effective? Results from a National Sample of Teachers. American Educational Research Journal 38 (4), 915–945.
- Grossman, P., S. Wineburg, and S. Woolworth. (2001). Toward a Theory of Teacher Community. Teacher College Record 103 (6), 942–1012.
- Guskey, T. (1999). Apply time with wisdom. Journal of Staff Development. 20. www.NSDC.org, access date: 18.05.2018
- Gümüş, S., Apaydın, Ç. & Bellibaş, M. Ş. (2018). Öğretmen Mesleki Öğrenme Ölçeği’nin Türkçe’ye Uyarlanması: Geçerlik ve Güvenirlilik Çalışması. Eğitim ve İnsani Bilimler Dergisi: Teori ve Uygulama, 9 (17), 107-124.
- Hacıoğlu, F. & Alkan, C. (1997). *Öğretmenlik Uygulamaları*, Ankara: Alkım Yayınları.

- Hammerness, K., Darling-Hammond, L., & Bransford, J. (2005). How teachers learn and develop. In L. Darling-Hammond & J. Bransford (Eds.), *Preparing teachers for a changing world: What teachers should learn and be able to do?* (pp. 358- 389). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Hargreaves, A. (2000). Four ages of professionalism and professional learning. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 6(2), 151-182.
- Hargreaves, E. and And Elhawary, D., (2019). Professional development through mutually respectful relationship: senior teachers' learning against the backdrop of hierarchical relationships. *Professional development in education*, 45 (1), 46-58.
- Hurst, B., & Reding, G. (2000). *Professionalism in Teaching*. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice Hall.
- İlğan, A., Aslanargün, A. & Shaukat, S. (2015). Öğretmenlik Mesleği Profesyonellik Ölçeği geçerlik ve güvenilirlik çalışması. *Eğitimde Kuram ve Uygulama*, 11 (4), 1454-1474.
- Karaaslan, D. (2003). Teachers' perceptions of self-initiated professional development: a case study on Baskent University English language teachers. Unpublished master's thesis. Middle East Technical University the Institute of Social Sciences.
- Karaca, D. (2015). İlk ve Ortaokullarda Bürokratikleşme Düzeyinin Öğretmen Profesyonelliğine Etkisi. Pamukkale üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Eğitim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı Eğitim Yönetimi Denetimi, Planlaması ve Ekonomisi Bilim Dalı. Unpublished doctoral dissertation.
- Karasar, N. (1998), *Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemi- Kavramlar, İlkeler, Teknikler*, Ankara: Nobel Yayıncılık.
- Karnak, B. (2020). Öğretmenlerin Mesleki Profesyonellikleri ile Örgütsel Mutlulukları Arasındaki İlişki. Pamukkale Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Eğitim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı Eğitim Yönetimi, Teftişi, Planlaması ve Ekonomisi Bilim Dalı. Unpublished MA thesis.
- Kent, A. M. (2004). Improving Teacher Quality Through Professional Development. *Education*. 124 (3), 427-435.
- Kramer, P. A., (2003). The ABC's of Professionalism. *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, , Volume 40, n 1, P. 22-25, Fall 2003, <https://www.tandfonline.com>, access date: 16.01.2019.
- Muyan, E. (2013). A Case Study on ELT Teachers' Perceptions Towards Professional Development Activities. Çağ University Institute of Social Sciences. Unpublished MA thesis.
- OECD (n.d.) Teachers' Professional Learning Study Design and Implementation Plan. <https://www.oecd.org/education/teachers-professional-learning-study/continuing-professional-learning/TPL-Study-Design-and-Implementation>, access date:

29.06.2022

- Oğuzkan, F. (1998). *Öğretmenliğin Üç Yönü*, Ankara: Kadioğlu Matbaacılık.
- Opfer, V. D., & D. Pedder. (2011). “Conceptualizing Teacher Professional Learning.” *Review of Educational Research* 81 (3), 376–407.
- Phelps, P. H. (2003). Teacher professionalism. *Kappa Delta Pi Record* 40(1), 10–11.
- Piazza, P., K. L. McNeill, and J. Hittinger. (2009) Developing a Voluntary Teacher Community: The Role of Professional Development, Collaborative Learning and Conflict. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, San Diego, CA, April.
- Richards, J. C. (2002). *The ideology of TESOL*. The Cambridge Guide To Teaching English to Speakers of other Languages. R, Carter, R. and Nunan, D. (Editor). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Safari I., Davaribina M. & Khoshnevis I. (2020). The Influence of EFL Teachers’ Self-Efficacy, Job Satisfaction and Reflective Thinking on their Professional Development: A Structural Equation Modeling, *Journal on Efficiency and Responsibility in Education and Science*, 13 (1), 27-40.
- Seifert, K. L. (1999). *Reflective thinking and professional development: A primer*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Shantz, D. and Prieur, P. D. (1996). Teacher professionalism and school leadership: an antithesis? *Education*, 116(3), 393-396.
- Sockett, H. (1993). *The moral base for teacher professionalism*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Stronge, J. (2002). Qualities of effective teachers. Alexandria, Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development. ascd.org access date: 18.05.2021
- Swisher, L. L., and C. G. Page. (2005). *Professionalism in physical therapy*. St. Louis, MO: Elsevier Saunders.
- Şişman, M. (1999). *Öğretmenlik Mesleğine Giriş*, Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık
- Temiz, A. (2016). Sınıf Öğretmenlerinin Öğretmenlik Mesleğindeki Profesyonelliğe İlişkin Görüşlerinin İncelenmesi (Hatay İli Örneği). Gaziantep Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Eğitim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı. Unpublished MA thesis.
- Tichenor, M. S. & Tichenor, J. M.(2005). Understanding Teachers’ Perspectives on Professionalism, *The Professional Educator*, Volume XXVII, Number 1 & 2, Fall 2004 & Spring 2005, 89-95.
- Uzun,S., Paliç, G. & Akdeniz, A. R. (2013). Fen ve Teknoloji Öğretmenlerinin Profesyonel Öğretmenliğe İlişkin Algıları. *Buca Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 35, 128-

143.

- Wayne, A. J., K. S. Yoon, P. Zhu, S. Cronen, and M. S. Garet. (2008). Experimenting with Teacher Professional Development: Motives and Methods.” Educational Researcher 37 (8), 469–479.
- Wested, Filby, N. (2000). *Teachers who learn kids who achieve: A look at schools with model Professional development*. WestEd Publication.
- Wilfried A., Joke K., Ditte L., Wouter S., Henk S., Ben S., Dineke T. ve Walter W. (2016) Affordances of teacher professional learning in secondary schools, Studies in Continuing Education, 38:3, 281-298. DOI: 10.1080/0158037X.2015.1114469
- Wong, H. K., & Wong, R. T. (1998). *The first days of school: How to be an effective teacher*. Mountainview, California. Harry K. Wong Publications.
- Yazıcıoğlu, Y. & Erdoğan S. (2014). *SPSS Uygulamalı Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemleri*, Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık.
- Yılmaz, K. & Altınkurt, Y. (2014). Öğretmenlerin Mesleki Profesyonelliği Ölçeği Geçerlik ve Güvenirlik Çalışması. International Journal of Human Sciences, 2 (11), 332-345.
- Yirci, R. (2017). Öğretmen Profesyonelliğinin Önündeki Engeller ve Çözüm Önerileri. Ahi Evran Üniversitesi Kırşehir Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi (KEFAD), 18 (1), 503-522.
- Zembat, R. & İlçi Küsmüş, G. (2020). Okul Öncesi Öğretmenlerinin Sınıf Yönetimi Becerileri ile Mesleki Profesyonellikleri Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi. Kastamonu Education Journal, 28 (4), 1725-1739.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the Journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC BY-NC-ND) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).